

Regarding Resolution 23 and the Presentation to the Student Achievements Committee

The Personal Transition Plan (PTP) is supposed to be a creative outlet from standardized testing, made to show more accurately and authentically on what students are capable of and what they have accomplished in their high school career. But schools across the state show inconsistency provided by the state guidelines. Plans are not the same format, or the same amount of work. They do not show the same amount of effort, and don't share the amount of benefit a student could receive on completion of their PTP. Recognizing this problem, I determined there needed to be a change in the format; thus I drafted a resolution and presented it at the Hawaii Secondary Student Conference as well as at the Hawaii State Board of Education, using Kealakehe High School's PTP process as a model.

Kealakehe High School, which I am modeling my resolution on, utilizes the PTP guidelines created by the DOE by providing an electronic portfolio for each student as they enter high school, where their advisory teacher consistently checks the work. There are certain elements that need to be completed in the PTP each year in order to pass the students advisory class. These elements include essays, best works, and information about their personal interests. When completing the "Best Works" section of the e-portfolio, there is a requirement to reflect on the Global Learner Outcomes (GLOs) provided by the states strategic plan, and Dr. Art Costa's Habits of Mind (HOM). When utilizing the HOMs in the E-portfolio program, students become inherently individualized.

When I address the Student Achievements Committee on April 17th, I will share my research, what I learned from DOE department personnel, and walk you through what I envision a completed PTP to look like. I look forward to seeing you there!

Caitlin Howard-Gomez

Caitlin Howard-Gomez

SCC Resolution 23

20 March 2012

Standardizing the Personal Transition Plan

Making an actual improvement in any community is an extremely difficult process. There are multiple steps in the process, from drafting a resolution to passing a law. One task for the Hawaii State Secondary Student Conference was to standardize the Personal Transition Plan's (PTP) curriculum statewide. The PTP is supposed to be a creative outlet from standardized testing, made to show more accurately and authentically on what students are capable of and what they have accomplished in their high school career. But schools across the state show inconsistency provided by the state guidelines. Plans are not the same format, or the same amount of work. They do not show the same amount of effort, and don't share the amount of benefit a student could receive on completion of their PTP. Recognizing this problem, I determined there needed to be a change in the format; thus I drafted a resolution and presented it at the Hawaii Secondary Student Conference as well as at the Hawaii State Board of Education, using Kealakehe High School's PTP process as a model.

Sherilyn Lau, the Carl D. Perkins Career and Technical Education (CTE) specialist said, "... the PTP program guidelines provide a wide variety of options for schools." "The Board of Education Policy 4540, *High School Graduation Requirements and Commencement* states that all students must complete a Personal Transition Plan (PTP) as a requirement toward earning a Hawaii High School Diploma" ("High School

Graduation Website"). The Department of Education also provides vague guidelines on how to create the PTP curriculum by creating a broad range of PTPs across the state.

The Personal Transition Plan (PTP) is defined as an individually designed and custom tailored plan of action for each high school student to move successfully from high school to post-secondary and/or career venues. The plan will have the elements of goal attainment, identification of available resources, evidence to support the plan of action taken, and a self-evaluation component. The design of the PTP shall take into account that the student, parent, and school personnel have a shared responsibility in the development and execution of the PTP during high school" ("High School Graduation Website").

The responsibility of development and design of the PTP goes to the staff of each school resulting in a wide variety of different PTP requirements, causing inconsistencies in PTPs throughout the State.

As I researched my resolution, these inconsistencies became evident.

According to some of the Student Activities Coordinators (SAC) in the State of Hawaii, Kaimuki High School has PTP classes built into their schedule for all four years; McKinley High School as well has an advisory class that teaches the PTP curriculum; Kohala High School students meet once a month with their PTP advisor to work on the PTP handbook that their school has created; Mililani High School also has a workbook that is needed to be completed with an advisory teacher; Kaiser High School students attend a 30 minute, twice-monthly class during all four years of high school to help them complete their PTP; and Kealahou High School uses the E-portfolio program online and each student must thoroughly complete each section on their own over the four years of high school. All the SAC's shared the uncertainty of not only the guidelines from their school, but from the state as well.

The uncertainty continued through the student population. When I was presenting my resolution at the Secondary Student Conference, the majority of the students had no idea what the PTP was, they constantly asked “What exactly is the PTP?” I had to explain every detail to multiple students, so they would know exactly what they were voting on. These are the top students of Hawaii, and if they are confused about the PTP or don’t even know what the PTP is, then something obviously needs to be changed in the guidelines and curriculum. Lau agrees saying, “However, detailed/descriptive PTP program guidelines would help to ensure a more consistent level of rigor and relevance across schools in the state. If the PTP program is to be valued by the students and the community, then it must maintain a consistent level of quality within the school and within every school across the state”.

The guidelines that have been provided by the State Department of Education (DOE) are too broad, which is the main source of the confusion. The guidelines state that all high schools need to implement a Personal Transition Plan for each student, which should be initiated as each student enters into high school and should be reviewed periodically by the student, school staff member, and parent. The state guidelines also provide Career Technical Education Model Benchmarks that are divided up by grade level. Kealakehe High School, which I am modeling my resolution on, utilizes these guidelines by providing an electronic portfolio for each student as they enter high school, where their advisory teacher consistently checks the work. There are certain elements that need to be completed in the PTP each year in order to pass the students advisory class. The BOE also made a plan for transient students, since different schools will have different curriculum for students, which states that they must complete the PTP from the

point of enrollment and shall be issued the .50 credit. Kealakehe allows transfer students to only complete the elements that are required for the years they attend their high school. Another part of the state guidelines say there needs to be a checklist to provide evidence of a student's progress toward the attainment of each benchmark. Again, Kealakehe follows the guidelines with a quarterly check from advisory teachers in order to pass the quarter, as well as a presentation of the PTP in the second semester of the student's senior year to a panel of three judges. The guidelines conclude with implementation methods creating a possible structure of the PTP, which recommends that the PTP should be completed online at some point. The guidelines are a great start for creating a PTP, but they need to be clarified to avoid confusion. Since the state made it so each school creates a PTP, each school created a completely different type of PTP, and so guidelines may be followed, but based on all the inconsistencies, some students don't receive a true benefit from this program that has helped other students prepare for their future, which according to many experts include the use of an electronic portfolio.

“The e-portfolio assessment system was developed to facilitate the assessment of student work” (Tubaishat). Tubaishat continues by explaining that e-portfolios will become important for colleges to evaluate the effectiveness of learning outcomes; and current students at Zayed University, much like Kealakehe High School, are required to develop an e-portfolio to showcase significant work to show their progress toward achieving their learner outcomes, then in their senior year, have to present their e-portfolio to a faculty panel and explain how their works relate to one or more college outcomes. “For students, the e-portfolio enriches their resume, both before and after graduation... E-portfolio enables students to improve and focus their learning and provide

them with a tool to showcase their skills” (Tubaishat). “A growing number of universities and education authorities within the United Kingdom (UK) as well as worldwide, are in the process of implementing the enhanced use of e-portfolios in Personal Development Plans (PDPs) as the main means of students’ learning and assessment” (Luchoomun). Luchoomun continues stating that the e-portfolio supports lifelong learning. “To operationalise the use of e-portfolios, specific guidance is issued to students about what is expected” (Luchoomun). “12 out of 20 students find the use of CMS [University of Dundee’s e-portfolio program] easy of manageable, for example, they can add artefacts to e-portfolios and they were excited with their e-portfolios. For example, a student commented that: ‘I am collecting my work in word and have managed to put some of these documents into my e-portfolio.’(Student)” (Luchoomun). E-portfolio applications allow students to all their activities and assignments into one location. (Ozgur) “E-portfolio supports...educational processes thanks to its large capacity of audio-visual content and allows the use of multi-purpose, systematic and efficient evaluation tools” (Ozgur). “E-portfolio...is important because it allows the construction of knowledge and offers different opportunities and multimedia options to evaluate prior knowledge” (Tuttle). “Providing and providing documents related to student achievement are some other important characteristics and opportunities of e-portfolios” (Ozgur). “Anadolu University Open and Distance Education System...have been using the e-portfolio applications effectively since 2008 as an assessment system. Anadolu University Open and Distance Education System has continuously increased the number of Bachelor’s degree, associate degree programs, and Bachelor’s degree completion programs” (Ozgur). “Those students can offer evidence of the activities they are involved in and

reflect their experiences as the advantages of e-portfolio. In addition, e-portfolio is seen as a solution to overcome problems such as the large number of distance education students and the limitations of time and human resources for evaluation” (Ozgun). Guo ve Greer emphasized that e-portfolios are not only learning and assessment activities; also they have positive effects among student-teacher and student-student communication and collaboration. It is research such as this that Kealakehe High School has based their PTP curriculum on, and according to my resolution so should the state. E-portfolio is just the vehicle to reflect a student’s high school career.

Rebecca M. Dedmond states “adolescents need to revisit their plans on a regular basis to update and verify that they are on the right track. The more realistic their plans, the more likely they’ll be to exert the energy and effort to follow through with those plans.” At the Kealakehe High School, students are required to complete three essays, a goals essay, persuasive essay and reflection essay. Throughout a student’s high school life, goals tend to change; the e-portfolio allows the students to instantly change their essay if necessary. The students start their goals and persuasive essays in their underclassman years, and are finalized in their senior year. The reflection essay is different; this essay is to be completed only in senior year to reflect on their high school life. With e-portfolio the essay becomes much simpler for the students because they have all the information they need within the e-portfolio site. An e-portfolio is not only easily updatable, but is also useful when writing reflective essays, completing a resume for job applications, or by using some of their best works in college.

A former student from Kealakehe High School, Natalie Mohr, has used multiple assignments from her “Best Work” section in e-portfolio within her freshman year of

college so far. Kealakehe requires students to input one work per class per semester through out high school, which gives students a numerous amount of assignments they can use in the future if needed. When completing the “Best Works” section of the e-portfolio, there is a requirement to reflect on the Global Learner Outcomes (GLOs) provided by the states strategic plan, and Dr. Art Costa’s Habits of Mind (HOM). “Far from limiting individuality of expression, the habits of mind encourage it...The habits of mind express a character-centered view of intelligence that honors the role of temperament and individual differences” (Tishman). When utilizing the HOMs in the E-portfolio program, students become inherently individualized; which is one of the major reasons behind the PTP. “[The Habits of Mind] emphasize curiosity, flexibility, posing problems, decision making, being reasonable, creativity, risk taking, and other behaviors that support critical and creative thought. Characteristics of all these lists is a respect for people’s abilities to make their own informed choices and to direct their own intellectual behaviors” (Tishman). All of these show a well-rounded view of student’s assignments, as well as help the student understand where they need improvement on future assignments. “Decision makers in any culture that wants to preserve itself...do their job best when they think critically about the decisions they make” (Tishman). The HOMs form students into decision makers the more they reflect on them. “The habits are a set of specific intellectual behaviors that support critical and creative thought within, across, and beyond school subjects”(Tishman). In common, E-portfolio and HOM’s help students beyond high school years, and should be continually used beyond the four years of high school.

“The four-or-five year graduation plan most schools require today is simply not enough to engage students in learning and prepare them for the realities of adulthood...A four-year plan might get students to graduate from high school. A five-year plan may get them into college, but we all know that 50 percent of college freshman do not graduate. What about economic sufficiency?”(Dedmond) Students need to prepare for more than five years, they should continuously prepare through life, setting goals is important and achieving them is even more important. “A CNN pole found that 48 percent of college graduates return home to live, and one year later 44 percent are still there. So it can’t be overestimated how critical it is for students to develop a vision of a productive adulthood and a carefully considered plan for a self-sufficient future” (Dedmond). If a student begins an e-portfolio in high school, they can easily continue it in their future since it will forever be easily accessible. “E-portfolios...are stories of cognitive exploration and development, of attempts at new things and the resulting mixed bag of success, near success, and failure. Each story is as unique as the individual who produces it; no two can be exactly alike because no two student have exactly the same academic and extracurricular experiences” (Brammer). Students need help when finding their inherently individual self when making goals and preparing for their future. My resolution to standardize the PTP curriculum would give each student an equal opportunity for that success, and an e-portfolio can be that help that each of those students will need. I have gone as far as presenting my resolution (see Appendix A) to 131 student delegates from across the state at the Secondary Student Conference, where it passed with a vote of 71 to 60, followed by a presentation to the Hawaii State Board of

Education, and I hope to present soon to the Hawaii Board of Education's Committee on Student Achievement, so this resolution of mine can be passed and turned into law.

APPENDIX A

2011 Secondary Student Conference

Curricular Concerns
Standardizing the Personal Transition Plan (PTP)
Resolution #23

CONCERNING: Standardizing the Hawaii State Department of Education’s Personal Transition Plan curriculum and instruction statewide.

WHEREAS, according to the Hawaii Career and Technical Education (CTE) Model State Profile, all students, as a part of their graduation requirements, will be required to prepare a PTP to become aware of opportunities in postsecondary education or entry into high-skill, high-wage or high-demand occupations in current or emerging fields; and

WHEREAS, according to the Hawaii Department of Education Office of Curriculum, Instruction, and Student Support's Personal Transition Plan Regulations, “PTP should reflect the standards that lead to the “Vision of the Public School Graduate” and be in concert with the CTE and the Hawaii Comprehensive Student Support System Model (CSSS). The basic operational premise is that the task and responsibility of educating each student resides in all members of the school, student, and parent/guardians”; and

WHEREAS, the PTP is counted as a 0.5 credit, and is required to complete in order to graduate, since the amendment to the Board Policy 4540 was adopted; and

WHEREAS, the responsibility of development and design of the PTP goes to the staff of each school resulting in a wide variety of different PTP requirements, causing inconsistencies in PTPs throughout the state; and

WHEREAS, according to some of the Student Activities Coordinators, Kaimuki High School has PTP classes built into their schedules for all 4 years; McKinley High School as well has an Advisory class that teaches the PTP curriculum; Kohala High School meets once a month with their PTP advisor to work on the PTP handbook that their school has created; Mililani High School also has a workbook that is needed to be completed with their advisory teacher; Kaiser High School students attend a 30 minute, twice-monthly class for all four years of high school to help them complete their PTP; and Kealakehe High School uses the E-portfolio program online and each student must thoroughly complete each section on their own over the four years of high school; and,

WHEREAS, Sherilyn Lau, the Carl D. Perkins Career and Technical Education (CTE) specialist said, “I agree that the PTP program guidelines provide a wide variety of options for schools. However, detailed/descriptive PTP program guidelines would help to ensure a more consistent level of rigor and relevance across schools in the state. If the PTP program is to be valued by the students and the community, then it must maintain a consistent level of quality within the school and within every school across the state.”; and,

WHEREAS, with the E-portfolio students can create and customize portfolios for academic, career, or personal uses; maintain their plan of study; and share their

work, goals, and achievements with advisors, career counselors, and employers. Faculty, departments, and institutions can create portfolio assignments linked to scoring rubrics. Assessment committees can randomly select portfolios, score them with rubrics, and generate assessment reports.”; therefore,
WHEREAS, the E-portfolio program is inherently individualized and systematically addresses the concepts in the B.O.E policy 4540.3a implementation guidelines;

BE IT RESOLVED, that the Secondary Student Conference recommends that high schools utilize the E-portfolio program to standardize the PTP curriculum and instruction;

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that in following years the PTP curriculum gradually increases to include the “Best Works”, a completed profile (with a picture, interests, hobbies, extra-curricular activities, clubs & organizations, and certificates & awards), a five-year plan (four-year high school course plan plus one year after graduation), a Personal Statement – the finalized one created Senior Year, a persuasive and goals essay (two essays), Complete the Personal Transition Plan of the E-portfolio program of the Education/Career/Goals sections, and then presented to a panel during second semester of senior year; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, copies of this resolution are forwarded to the Department of Education, the Principals of Hawaii High Schools, the Hawaii State Student Council, and the Curriculum Coordinators of each school.

Work Cited

- Brammer, Charlotte. "Eportfolios and Cognitive Storytelling: Making the Journey Personal." (2011): 352-355. Print.
- Dedmond, Rebecca. "Planning your 10-year plan." *Launching Students into their Decade of Transition*. (2008): 16-17. Print.
- Guo, Z. "Connecting E-Portfolios and Learner Models." *Proceedings of World Conference on E-Learning in Corporate, Government, Healthcare, and Higher Education*. N.p., n.d. Web. 10 Feb 2012.
- "High School Graduation Requirements And Commencement Policy." *Board Policy 4540*. N.p., n.d. Web. 10 Feb 2012.
<<http://lilinode.k12.hi.us/STATE/BOE/POL1.NSF/85255a0a0010ae82852555340060479d/91ae48edb6f3e0140a2566a3006f0dec?OpenDocument>>.
- Lau, Sherilyn. Personal Email. 5 Dec. 2011. 10 Feb. 2012.
- Luchoomun, Dharmadeo, Joe McLuckie, and Maarten van Wesel. "Collaborative E-Learning: E-Portfolios For Assessment, Teaching And Learning." *Electronic Journal Of E-Learning* 8.1 (2010): 21-30. ERIC. Web. 10 Feb. 2012.
- Ozgur, Aydin Ziya, and Secil Kaya. "The Management Aspect Of The E-Portfolio As An Assessment Tool: Sample Of Anadolu University." *Turkish Online Journal Of Educational Technology - TOJET* 10.3 (2011): 296-303. ERIC. Web. 10 Feb. 2012.
- "Personal Transition Plan (PTP)." *High School Graduation Website*. Hawaii Department of Education, 28 nov 2011. Web. 6 Feb 2012.
<<http://graduation.k12.hi.us/ptp.html>>.

"Personal Transition Plan FAQ." *Kealakehe High School - Bulletin Board*. Kealakehe High School, n.d. Web. 10 Feb 2012.

<http://khsweaveriders.org/apps/bbmessages/show_bbm.jsp?REC_ID=36443>.

Tishman, Shari. "Why Teach Habits of Mind?." 42-51. Print.

Tubaishat, Abdallah, Azzedine Lansari, and Akram Al-Rawi. "E-Portfolio Assessment System For An Outcome-Based Information Technology Curriculum." *Journal Of Information Technology Education* 8.(2009): IIP-43-IIP-54. *Education Research Complete*. Web. 10 Feb. 2012.

Tuttle, H.G.. "Digital-Age Assessment: E-Portfolios Are The Wave Of The Future." *Technology & Learning*. N.p., n.d. Web. 10 Feb 2012.

2011 Secondary Student Conference

Curricular Concerns
Standardizing the Personal Transition Plan (PTP)
Resolution #23

- 1 **CONCERNING:** Standardizing the Hawaii State Department of Education’s Personal
2 Transition Plan curriculum and instruction statewide.
- 3 **WHEREAS,** according to the Hawaii Career and Technical Education (CTE) Model State
4 Profile, all students, as a part of their graduation requirements, will be required to prepare
5 a PTP to become aware of opportunities in postsecondary education or entry into high-
6 skill, high-wage or high-demand occupations in current or emerging fields; and
- 7 **WHEREAS,** according to the Hawaii Department of Education Office of Curriculum,
8 Instruction, and Student Support's Personal Transition Plan Regulations, “PTP should
9 reflect the standards that lead to the “Vision of the Public School Graduate” and be in
10 concert with the CTE and the Hawaii Comprehensive Student Support System Model
11 (CSSS). The basic operational premise is that the task and responsibility of educating
12 each student resides in all members of the school, student, and parent/guardians”; and
- 13 **WHEREAS,** the PTP is counted as a 0.5 credit, and is required to complete in order to graduate,
14 since the amendment to the Board Policy 4540 was adopted; and
- 15 **WHEREAS,** the responsibility of development and design of the PTP goes to the staff of each
16 school resulting in a wide variety of different PTP requirements, causing inconsistencies
17 in PTPs throughout the state; and
- 18 **WHEREAS,** according to some of the Student Activities Coordinators, Kaimuki High School
19 has PTP classes built into their schedules for all 4 years; McKinley High School as well
20 has an Advisory class that teaches the PTP curriculum; Kohala High School meets once a
21 month with their PTP advisor to work on the PTP handbook that their school has created;
22 Mililani High School also has a workbook that is needed to be completed with their
23 advisory teacher; Kaiser High School students attend a 30 minute, twice-monthly class
24 for all four years of high school to help them complete their PTP; and Kealahou High
25 School uses the E-portfolio program online and each student must thoroughly complete
26 each section on their own over the four years of high school; and,
- 27 **WHEREAS,** Sherilyn Lau, the Carl D. Perkins Career and Technical Education (CTE) specialist
28 said, “I agree that the PTP program guidelines provide a wide variety of options for
29 schools. However, detailed/descriptive PTP program guidelines would help to ensure a
30 more consistent level of rigor and relevance across schools in the state. If the PTP
31 program is to be valued by the students and the community, then it must maintain a
32 consistent level of quality within the school and within every school across the state.”;
33 and,
- 34 **WHEREAS,** with the E-portfolio students can create and customize portfolios for academic,
35 career, or personal uses; maintain their plan of study; and share their work, goals, and
36 achievements with advisors, career counselors, and employers. Faculty, departments, and
37 institutions can create portfolio assignments linked to scoring rubrics. Assessment

38 committees can randomly select portfolios, score them with rubrics, and generate
39 assessment reports.”; therefore,

40 **WHEREAS**, the E-portfolio program is inherently individualized and systematically addresses
41 the concepts in the B.O.E policy 4540.3a implementation guidelines;

42

43 **BE IT RESOLVED**, that the Secondary Student Conference recommends that high schools
44 utilize the E-portfolio program to standardize the PTP curriculum and instruction;

45 **BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED**, that in following years the PTP curriculum gradually
46 increases to include the “Best Works”, a completed profile (with a picture, interests,
47 hobbies, extra-curricular activities, clubs & organizations, and certificates & awards), a
48 five-year plan (four-year high school course plan plus one year after graduation), a
49 Personal Statement – the finalized one created Senior Year, a persuasive and goals essay
50 (two essays), Complete the Personal Transition Plan of the E-portfolio program of the
51 Education/Career/Goals sections, and then presented to a panel during second semester of
52 senior year; and

53 **BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED**, copies of this resolution are forwarded to the Department of
54 Education, the Principals of Hawaii High Schools, the Hawaii State Student Council, and
55 the Curriculum Coordinators of each school.